

How to Cosplay Catholicism to Attack Israel

THE LIE

Catholicism is anti-Zionist and teaches that Jews killed Jesus.

THE TRUTH

The Catholic Church has explicitly affirmed Israel's right to exist and formally repudiated the charge of collective Jewish guilt for Jesus's death.

BACKGROUND

- On February 9, 2025, Carrie Prejean Boller claimed during a hearing of the U.S. Religious Liberty Commission that “Catholics do not embrace Zionism.” She went on to make a series of false statements about Israel, spoken as a Catholic, and refused to affirm Israel’s right to exist. ([X](#))
- Boller, who wore a Palestinian flag on her lapel and complained about “Islamophobia,” also blamed Jews for killing Jesus. She confronted Pastor J.C. Cooper for refusing to attribute Jesus’s death to Jews today. ([X](#))
- She further insisted that denying Israel’s right to exist is not antisemitic.
- Although the hearing was convened to address antisemitism, Boller repeatedly attempted to redirect the discussion toward condemning Israel for a so-called “genocide” in Gaza.

TRUTH EXPLAINED

- Zionism is the conviction that Israel has an inherent and legitimate right to exist as the national home of the Jewish people. The Vatican has repeatedly recognized Israel’s right to exist as a legitimate, sovereign state through formal diplomatic agreements and official statements. This is the opposite of anti-Zionism, which denies Israel the right to exist. ([Vatican](#)), ([Vatican](#)), ([ANSA](#))
- Claims that Catholics blame Jews for Jesus’s death are also false. In *Nostra Aetate*, promulgated under Pope Paul VI, the Holy See affirmed that Jesus’s death cannot be blamed on all Jews of Jesus’s time, nor against Jews today. ([EBSCO](#))
- Pope Francis explicitly affirmed Israel’s right to exist and warned that any “outright attack” on the State of Israel crosses into antisemitism. ([Christianity Today](#))
- A majority of Catholics express expansive support for Israel’s legitimacy: 56% agree that Israel’s right to the land extends to the biblical borders of Israel. ([Jerusalem Post](#))
- A 2024 survey found that 62% of U.S. Christians believe it is antisemitic to some extent to say Israel does not have the right to exist, including 48% who say it is *definitely* antisemitic. ([Chosen People Ministries](#))
- Only 8% of U.S. Christians agree that Jews are responsible for the death of Jesus, while 62% attribute Jesus’s death to the sins of humanity or to God’s salvific plan. ([Chosen People Ministries](#))
- Contemporary Catholic opinion further undermines Boller’s claims. A 2023 study found that 34.8% of Catholics said they support the State of Israel, compared with just 11.4% who said they support Palestine—demonstrating that Boller’s views represent a minority position among Catholics. ([St. Joseph’s University](#))
- Boller’s repeated accusations of “genocide” have also been widely debunked. Most of Hamas’s reported death toll consists of combatants, and Israel’s estimated civilian-to-combatant casualty ratio is roughly 2:1—far below the UN’s estimated global average of 9:1 for urban warfare. Furthermore, polls show most Gazans still support the war—making the claim of genocide absurd, since it implies they support their own extermination. ([UN](#)), ([TOJ](#)), ([Honest Reporting](#)), ([Hamas](#))
- Public opinion reflects this skepticism. Forty-one percent of U.S. Christians say it is “probably false” that Israel is committing a genocide in Gaza, while another 34% say they are unsure. When asked whether Israel deliberately targets civilians, only 19% said this is “probably true,” compared with 51% who said it is “probably false.” ([Chosen People Ministries](#))

QUOTES

- "To attack Jews is anti-Semitism, but an outright attack on the State of Israel is also anti-Semitism. There may be political disagreements...but the State of Israel has every right to exist in safety and prosperity." — Pope Francis
- "In the simple answer to the question, 'Who killed Jesus?' I would say, I did. If I had not sinned, he wouldn't have had to die...so if that's the case, and his death was the only means by which there would be a pure enough sacrifice to bring redemption, then how do I blame just one group of people, be it the Jews, the Romans, or anybody else?...The bible says very clearly that his life was not taken from him. He *gave* his life." — Mike Huckabee

Take Away

Carrie Prejean Boller does not speak for Catholics. She misuses the label to launder claims the Catholic Church itself has rejected for decades. By denying Israel's right to exist, reviving the charge of Jewish guilt for Jesus's death, and redefining antisemitism to excuse those positions, Boller is not offering a "Catholic perspective." She is contradicting settled Church teaching, distorting Catholic moral authority, and weaponizing religious identity to legitimize ideas the Church explicitly condemned after the Holocaust. What she presented was ideology, not faith, and Catholics should say so plainly.